
MARRAKECH – ccNSO: Members Meeting Day 1 (1 of 3)
Tuesday, June 25, 2019 – 09:00 to 10:15 WET
ICANN65 | Marrakech, Morocco

KATRINA SATAKI: Good morning, dear ladies and gentlemen. Please take your seats. We are ready to start.

Thank you. Again, good morning, good afternoon and evening to those who join us remotely from different corners in the world. As always, it's a great pleasure to see you all here, face to face. It's great to have some remote participants. This is the time when we'll try to engage those remote participants even more.

Again, this is a ccNSO members meeting. For two days we are here together. We discuss things. We participate and sometimes – well, Alejandro will tell you more about what to expect today and tomorrow. Before that, it's a pleasure to be here in Marrakech, Morocco. Our local host, .ma, is here to welcome us, so let me introduce Afaf from .ma and give her the floor to address the audience and talk more about the .ma domain. Afaf the floor is yours.

AFAF EL MAAYATI: Thank you. Good morning. I'm Afaf El Maayati. I'm representing the Telecom Regulatory Agency, the local host for this meeting.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

On behalf of the [inaudible] and together with my colleagues, we are really pleased to welcome you to ICANN 65, the third meeting in Morocco in such an amazing city, Marrakech.

ANRT is the telecom regulator, but it is also the registry .ma domain names. For this, we have prepared some slides in order to give you an overview about .ma domain names. As I said before, ANRT is a public body responsible for the regulation of the telecommunications sector in Morocco. It was created in 1998 under telecom law. ANFT is also in charge of managing both of the ccTLDs, .ma and [noctaarabic] for Arabic domain names.

Here we have some indicators about the Internet in Morocco. At the end of March of this year, the total number of Internet subscribers has reached more than 23 million, with a penetration rate of more than 65%.

Here we have some indicators about the .ma names. As you can see, this graph shows a constant evolution of the number of .ma domain names. At the end of March of this year, the total number of .ma domains names registered has reached more than 73,000. We had about 70,000 new registrations in the last year. Actually, we are currently working on some actions in order to enhance and boost the number of new registrations.

Here we have some indicators from annual observation of .ma names, which is available on our website, www.anrt.ma.

[inaudible] 80% of .ma domain names are renewed each year, which is I guess very [inaudible] renewal. Also, we have more than 86% of registrants that are established in Morocco. 45% of .ma domain names are associated with active websites. We have 45 .ma registrars [inaudible]. Two of them are accredited from ICANN.

Here we have important states from the .ma history. The .ma as a TLD was delegated in 1992. In 2006, we had got the re-delegation from the ccTLD from ICANN. Later, in 2011, we had gotten the delegation of .[almalarab] for Arabic domain names [inaudible]. Program. In March 2015, we had deployed a new platform, a new .ma platform, which is completely automated and based on the EPP protocol. About one year later, we had deployed DNSSEC.

For .ma governance, we have adopted a model, what we call the 3R Model: registries, registrars, and registrants. The role of the registry is assumed by the ANRT, so we are setting the technical and administrative policies. Then we have the registrars, who are responsible for the registration and the management of domain names. And we have their customers, the registrants.

Here we have some .ma rules. As I said before, the .ma platform is completely automated based on EPP. The domain name is provisioned immediately and activated in the .ma zone in less than 15 minutes. But for some limits of the cases, a domain name,

before being registered, needs prior validation from ANRT; for example, for what we call the reserved terms. If domain names contain a term related to a national authority, it needs prior validation from ANRT; also, if the domain name is requested under the extension .gov.ma, which is totally reserved to governmental institutions.

We have adopted the auto-renewal process and, for expired domain names, we grant a grace period. Also, it is possible to apply for the registrar and registry lock. Registry lock, as you know, is for strategic domain names which provide a good layer of security against hijacking. All information about .ma names is available on our website. www.registry.ma. The Arabic version is available on the Arabic website. [inaudible].

For registrars for legal reasons, the registrars should be established in Morocco and we [conclude] an agreement with them. According to this agreement, the registrar should be conformed to .ma rules. For this, we do periodic checks. We inform also the registrars with the anomaly that we have detected.

For registrants, actually we don't deal directly with them, but we have deployed some rules in order to protect their interests. For example, for the treatment of the personal data of the registrants, it is done according to the national rules. Also, the registrant

could challenge the registrar at any moment using the EPP code. For registrants also, it has some responsibilities. He is responsible for the personal use of its domain name and the websites related.

As the .ma registry, we receive complaints and claims concerned in .ma domain names; for example, when there is a problem with the name of the registrants as it is published in the WHOS. But when the dispute concerns .ma domain names related to trademark which is protected in Morocco, the registrant is subject to what we call the alternate dispute resolution procedure, which is completely administered by WIPO.

Also, we can receive some different requests regarding .ma domain names: if the domain is related to illegal or fraudulent activities, if it is registered to be resold to the right person. We can also receive complaints, or if the content of .ma websites is unlawful or contrary to morals, etc.

As the .ma registry, we organize some events and training. For example, we organize an annual meeting with the .ma registrars every March. Recently in March of this year we had organized the .ma Domain Day with ICANN. The [slogan “domain name” is] an important aspect for a company in order to make aware the Moroccan companies of the necessity to protect their domain names.

Also, we are organizing trainings with ICANN. We have organized DNS trainings, marketing workshops, etc., and for this I would like to say thank you to ICANN for its unconditional and [habitual] collaboration.

For the last slide, ICANN, [the ANRT, as an African ccTLD regulator, deploy training exchanges in order to promote participation with the other African partners. Annually, we receive several African delegations. For the last DNSSEC training held in Rabat, we have also invited participants from seven African ccTLDs.

That's all. Thank you very much for your attention. I hope this was informative. It was really a pleasure for me to talk to you today. I hope that the ccNSO meetings will be successful and fruitful, as usual. Again, welcome to Marrakech. Please enjoy your stay here to visit such an amazing city. Thank you very much.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you very much for your presentation and thank you very much for your warm welcome. Are there questions, perhaps?

If not, then, again, thank you very much. I hope that we will have an opportunity – oh, we have a question – to discuss and ask in less formal environment, perhaps.

[JEH PODEL]: I'm [Jeh Podel] from India. I want to ask, do you have some figures for IDN ccTLD registrations as well, like I have seen, for .ma?

AFAF EL MAAYATI: For .ma or for .[almalarab] in Arabic?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: In Arabic.

AFAF EL MAAYATI: In Arabic?

[JEH PODEL]: Yes.

AFAF EL MAAYATI: Actually, .[almalarab] was delegated to ANRT from 2011 but we didn't have the management of .[almalarab] in the law. But recently, the telecom law has been amended and we have this extension as an official Moroccan extension. So although we have a [inaudible] a pilot project and we have just some domain names for tests.

[JEH PODEL]: Okay. Can we register those ccTLDs now in Arabic?

AFAF EL MAAYATI: Yeah.

[JEH PODEL]: Okay.

AFAF EL MAAYATI: It is open – it’s not yet [open] but we will do it very shortly.

[JEH PODEL]: Okay. Thank you.

AFAF EL MAAYATI: Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. If there are no more questions, Afaf will be around. So please use the opportunity to ask any questions that you probably are too shy to ask now. Let me also remind you that we have an opportunity to submit questions remotely. You can send an e-mail. You can connect using Zoom. So please feel free to submit your questions. I can tell you in secret that, if there’s line standing for a mic and you submit a question online, you will be given priority. So please use this opportunity, too.

So thank you. With that, let me give the floor to Alejandra. She will tell you more about ccNSO Members Meeting Days. Please, Alejandra, the floor is yours.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Hello. Thank you very much. I will stand up. Good morning, everyone. I hope you had a nice breakfast. Let me show you around and what we will be doing these two days ... whoops. You can see there that there are the members of the meeting program committee. If you happen to see them, now you see their faces. If you see them here in Marrakech, please do not hesitate to contact them if you have any questions or suggestions or if you want something that could be improved. Please, this is all the team that makes this meeting possible.

Also, please meet our ccNSO Secretariat, who are the real core at the ccNSO and who can help us do anything we want. If you don't want to contact us, then maybe you can contact the ccNSO. That's their e-mail. So please don't hesitate to write them an e-mail.

By any chance, is anyone a newcomer? It's your first time here in an ICANN meeting or a ccNSO meeting?

Welcome. For all our newcomers, please know that we have a website in ICANN Learn where you can find lots of information of

ICANN of the ccNSO. We have also a quick guide to the ccNSO, and we have printed guides with [Sean] here. If you want one, you can get one with him. Sean, please ... thank you. So they can see you. Be welcome here in the ccNSO.

Regarding presentations, agendas, and summaries, you will find them all online. As you can see, the first link is the quickest access. There you will find the schedule of all the ICANN meetings or ccNSO meetings and the presentations/slides. So that's the quickest access. There will also be the agenda for the ccNSO Members Meeting. Also, you can sync your calendar with our Google Calendar at ccNSO.agenda.agenda@gmail.com. In our wiki, you will find even more information. So that should give you plenty of help to catch up with subjects that you might have missed for a while.

For today, Day 1, we will have a session on Council priorities by Katrina. We will have a session on working group updates that will be chaired by Barrack and a policy session that will be chaired by Patricio. In the afternoon, we will have high-interest topics, since this is a policy forum. We will leave this room and will move to the [Crystal] room, which is the GAC room also, to have two high-interest topics. At 3:15 we will have policy aspects of DNS-over-HTTPS, DNS-over-TLS, and related issues. And we will having evolving effectiveness of ICANN's multi-stakeholder model.

Today will end with a very fun event. Thank you to all our sponsors. We will have a community networking event. For this, you are required to have an invitation. Invitations are in the hands of Kim and Bart. Please, please, please, we have a limited number of people who can attend, so if you are not planning to go, do not take an invitation. But if you do, please go and find them, maybe at a coffee break. Not right now. But do get your invitations so you can come into the networking events.

For tomorrow, we will have ccNSO-appointed ICANN Board member session, chaired by Jordan. We will have a ccTLD financial contribution that I will be chairing. Also, there will an IANA naming function and ICANN specific reviews, chaired by Abdalla. After that, we will have one of our most popular sessions. That is ccTLD News. That will be chaired by [Barbara]. We will have the latest update on the ccNSO organizational review of the Meridian Institute.

We end the day with two Council meetings; first our Council meeting that will be in the room [Opal], so we will have to change rooms. After that, we will have a ccNSO and GNSO Council meeting in the room Tichka.

On our last day, there will be two cross-community topics that will be held also in the [Crystal] room or the GAC room. Those are

the impact of GDR and EPDP Phase 1, and the policy around universal acceptance.

Some important information that I will please like you to consider is the following. Do you speak English? Do you? Yes, we do. But not all of us are native English speakers, starting with myself. Sorry for the accent. If you take this into consideration, please, whenever you come to the microphone, try to speak as slowly and as – how do you say? – articulate as possible so everybody in the room can understand you. Please say your name and where you're from. Please do use your microphones, as Katrina has already told you. We want to know what you want to say or what your questions are. But if you are too shy to come to the microphone, we have the Zoom room available for everyone. That is linked. You can find the link over there or on the website in the schedule.

Also super important: keep calm but be on time. We would like to run our things very orderly and on time, so mind the time.

Again, your input is very important for us at the NPC and at the ccNSO. We want to know your feedback, so please, tomorrow we will have our survey launched. If you have anything you would like to tell us, please fill out the survey. Let us know if you like the setting, the sessions, the content, or what you would like to see in the next ccNSO meeting.

Also, it's not all about the ccNSO face-to-face meetings. We can keep in touch by all the available social media. There's Twitter, Facebook, the website, the wiki. There is a newsletter that you can subscribe to get notifications monthly of what is going on monthly in the ccNSO and, again, the ccNSO Secretariat e-mail.

And welcome to the ccNSO.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you very much, Alejandra. Are there any questions about the logistics about the agenda or anything else related to the ccNSO meetings or other meetings here during this ICANN week?

If no, then thank you very much again, Alejandra.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO:

Thanks a lot to our meetings program committee because it was thanks to them that we have an interesting agenda.

Now, with great pleasure, I'll give the floor to myself for the next update on Council priorities.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

[inaudible]

KATRINA SATAKI:

Okay, thank you. So, ccNSO Council priorities. Today, during this presentation and probably during some other presentations and especially tomorrow, we'll hear information about the ccNSO review and results and recommendations coming out of this review. We will talk about some of these recommendations and some feedback that we received through the ccNSO review.

One of the feedbacks that some community members gave was, "It's not entirely clear. What does the ccNSO Council do?" When I read the report and all those questions, I really could picture our community members generally wondering, "Why do we have Council? And what do they really do there?"

Now I will try to answer your questions and actually address some other things that came out from the review. First, let's go to the basics. Sorry for that, but everything starts with the bylaws. The bylaws clearly define the role of the ccNSO Council and what we are supposed to do. Of course, if we do not do that and we do not meet your expectations, we're always happy to hear your feedback. That is why members vote and members select ccNSO members.

The role of the Council is to administer and coordinate everything around the ccNSO and also manage the development of policy. Sometimes, from time to time to time, members can say, "No, you

have to do this and you have to this and you have to do this,” and the Council has to follow the lead.

Internally, in our own guidelines – again, we stress this role of the ccNSO Council as an administrative body. But we also represent and engage on behalf of our members because we have to represent the views and we have to participate in different setups.

Let us not forget that the Council also has a role to manage everything around the ccNSO being a decisional participant. This also comes as one of the tasks.

What is this all about and how do we come up with all the things that we do? Actually, we could look at that from three different perspectives or three big blocks. One big block is recurring ccNSO activities; for example, Council elections, or some other things that are either in the bylaws or in our own guidelines, something that we have to do every now and then. Usually it’s either once a year or maybe more often, maybe less often.

Then there are some other ICANN-related activities. Well, I call them ICANN-related activities. Sometimes they are not even ICANN-related, not that ICANN generates them; for example, the IANA stewardship transition. It really just got up on us, so we just had to do that. [Those other things] that we had to do were on a global ICANN scale.

Then then there is ccNSO policy and policy-related activities, not only PDP but also some other work that is maybe not a formal PDP (policy development process) but still is something that's related to policy.

When we have all these three things, we try to put them into some bigger blocks and really have activities under each of the block. Again, going back to the ccNSO review, some people said, "The ccNSO Council workplan is too complicated." Well, sorry. It is what it is. We can think of the ways to make it more accessible to others. If you have suggestions on how you want to see Council work described, please let us know. But this is how we currently do it.

That ends the general outline, where we come with more detailed workplan that we have to follow.

How do we add activities? That's also a very interesting question: how it looks in theory. We receive those requests from different channels and by different means. Again, there are some certain things that are required in the bylaws or in our own procedures. Then sometimes we receive requests from other supporting organizations or advisory committees. For example, [for us to] participate in working groups.

Sometimes, ICANN's Board of Directors come up with a resolution saying, "All you have to do" – maybe not "have to do," but,

“Please, would you look into (for example) IDN variants together with GNSO?” or, “Would you please consider the use of emojis in second-level domains?”

Another thing for example is NomCom. Now we will need to appoint a representative to NomCom. So soon we will issue a call for volunteers. Sometimes there are things that ICANN also asks us to do; for example, provide comments to some documents.

Those requests can come as e-mails or resolutions. During our bilateral meetings, we can agree to do something, and sometimes even in blog posts we can discover we can need to react.

Yeah, sorry. A little bit more. In the ccNSO Council, one of the committees that we have is the triage committee. The idea of this committee is to do the initial evaluation of all those incoming requests. So they look into the details of the request and then provide some advice to the Council on what to do with those requests.

What can we do? Very often we see that, if it’s related or might be of interest to some ccTLDs, we share information with our members and our non-members. We can raise the issue and discuss it during our face-to-face meetings. We can create and participate in working groups and participate in working groups that are created or are established by other SOs/ACs. We can issue

Council statements when we really see that the – I think it's very important for us that we have these statements.

Lately, we're very active with expressing the position. That's one of my favorite: [to do] nothing because it's really not related to ccTLDs, or daily activities. We can't do everything. We have to be really very selective about those things. If there's nothing we can contribute, if it really does not concern us, then we just say thank you. But this time we do not provide any input.

What are the actual priorities at the moment? First, of course, the PDP on the retirement of ccTLDs. You will hear updates today, a little bit later. You also can go to the wiki page and see all the materials that they have at the moment.

Another – this is more policy-related work – is we have established a Preliminary Review Team to look into this IDN ccTLD process and advise the Council and the community on a proposed way forward. So they will basically look into questions like, what needs to be addressed in follow-up actions, and how should these topics be addressed?

For some of the upcoming Council statements, we have decided that we need to prepare. One is on the process proposal for streamlining organizational reviews because we think that all the reviews, including organizational reviews, take too much time

and probably they should be done differently. They take too much time and are too expensive, perhaps.

One of our proposals was actually submitted by the ccNSO. We asked to change the ICANN bylaws to make sure that we can compose an IANA function review team from the best candidates that we have, regardless of their membership, whether they're members or non-members. So it really doesn't matter as long as they are professionals and good experts and ready to contribute to the work. Also, we'll think about having a statement on this draft final report of our review.

Some of the appointments we'll need to make are for the Customer Standing Committee. Byron's term ends. He's eligible for reelection. Nevertheless, the term ends and we have to issue a call. Another thing is RZERC. That's Root Zone ... something ... Yeah, Committee. "C" stands for Committee. I knew that two years ago, three years ago. Now I completely forgot. RZERC is Root Zone ...

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [inaudible] Evolution [inaudible]

KATRINA SATAKI: Evolution Reform Committee?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Review.

KATRINA SATAKI: Review Committee, yes. Root Zone Evolution Review Committee: RZERC. Thank you very much. Thank you. And NomCom stands for Nominating Committee. That one I know. So we will need to make at least these three appointments.

Then, in August and September, we will start launching elections, so we'll need Council elections and elections to the ICANN Board seat, apparently #11. Maybe Nigel – what's your seat number?

NIGEL ROBERTS: 12.

KATRINA SATAKI: 12. Yes, so it goes for Seat 11. Not that it matters, but it's a really interesting fact.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

KATRINA SATAKI:

No, it wasn't. Of some other things that came out from the ccNSO review that we would really like to address, one of the things was we need to fix our website. We already started pulling [strings] – we did it all the time, but now, with this official recommendation, we have – yes. Even our reviewers, independent people; it's not just who are complaining about the website. Everybody now sees that our website is horrible. So please help us to fix it and address this recommendation.

Of course, it's always good to have new active people on Board. It's great that you're all here. It would be even better if you all were active participants and not just laugh at me giving a presentation but also could comment and give presentations yourself.

I'd really like to talk more about this. One of the questions I kept asking myself was, why are there different levels of participation? They differ from region to region. They differ from registry to registry. Actually, found an answer myself. I'm not saying that is the right answer. Nevertheless, I'd like to share it with you and see if maybe you agree. Maybe not. Maybe it doesn't matter to you. I thought about Maslow's hierarchy of needs. I think you all know that. I'm not going into an academic discussion on the thing, on whether that's right or wrong, because I know that many people say, "Yeah, I'm sure that doctors object to this." I know really it's

a debatable thing. Let's put it that way. But nevertheless, it's one of the most used concepts that normal people can understand.

I tried to put it into the ccTLD perspective. How do we start our operations? We need to set up physical infrastructure and some basic things to make sure that we can start registering domain names that we can run a ccTLD. If we have nothing, then probably that's the only thing that concerns us: how we can build this infrastructure. When we have it in place, we start adding some layers of security, like DNSSEC, like firewalls and everything.

When we're done with that, we can say, "Now we can see what others are doing," so we join regional organizations. We join the ccNSO. We start listening. Probably we can learn something about the ways to improve our physical infrastructure, our basic operations, security. We go to Tech Day. You see, Maslow's hierarchy of needs is not that bad to get people to Tech Day.

When we have learned [not] to listen to others, we think, "Now we can start presenting ourselves." So we start giving presentations about the way we build our physical infrastructure and the way we ensure security or the way we collaborate, perhaps. Life is too short to make all the mistakes ourselves, so we have to learn from others. That's why this community is really very great. We can share our experience and tell others, probably, what went wrong.

When we've done that, at some point, we say, "Now we can be more active. We can participate in working groups. We can actively participate, not just sign up for working groups, and even get elected to some positions on the Council and actually start giving back to the community something that you learned from others and at some point you just feel that now it's time for you to give something back. Again, I'm not saying this is right. It's just my theory of why some people are more active than others. It's for you to see where you are and when you're ready to be a more active participant.

Normally, of course, people will say, "I don't know anything. Others know better." Is that true? Yes, maybe. They know definitely better about their own situation. At the same time, no, of course they do not know better than you. I really like this picture because it shows that everybody in the room thinks that others perhaps know better and they should speak. Actually, this is what sometimes happens. I have spoken to many people and now I must say that really many people have told me the same. That's why I wanted to address this today.

It's clear that, very often, when we discuss things, when we work in groups, discussions are dominated by, usually, Europeans and North Americans. They are people with probably better English skills, so these discussions are dominated. Some people feel they

do not belong to these regions. Some people that they are being dominated by those who come forward and express their views.

Here I'd like to say that it's not that they do it on purpose to dominate or on purpose to make you feel worse. It's just part of our culture that we are not afraid to ask silly questions. Here I mean Europeans and North Americans. There's no such thing as a silly question. There can be a silly answer, of course. It's okay to say something wrong. It's okay not to understand something. I realize that, for some other cultures, it's not okay. They don't feel comfortable asking questions.

Here I really would like to invite others. You really have to overcome this. Nobody will think that you're stupid just because you don't understand something. It's normal not to understand things. Believe me, now I feel like I know more or less many things that are happening. But still, there are many, many things I do not know, I do not understand, and I need to ask. So it's really okay to ask. It's really okay to something even if it turns out to be wrong.

So when those Europeans or North Americans dominate the discussion, don't let them. Just start speaking up. Start expressing your views. When I speak to people one-to-one, I'm really shocked by the wise thoughts that they have, but they were too shy to share them with the group. Please don't be like that. That's the only advise I can tell you. When Europeans are

dominating, they do not do it because they feel more smart or wise or anything. It's just what we are.

Now I'd like to address those Europeans and North Americans who usually dominate the discussion. If you see someone from other regions standing next to you, just take this extra step and ask them, what's your opinion? We really need to bridge this gap from both sides. It's not something that can happen from one side.

I think that, at the end, diversity is a strength because it can be a strength, but, if we let our diversity divide us, it's not a strength. It's definitely a weakness. So I would really like to invite you to be more understanding of the diversity that we have here.

Coming back to the same issue of "I don't know. I have no idea," just go for it. I'm sure you will learn how to do it. There's no other way.

To sum it up, what the ccNSO Council does, what our current priorities are, again, as I said, it's a PDP on the retirement of ccTLDs, IDN ccTLD-policy related work, appointments and elections, as I mentioned, and we have statements in line. Definitely there will be some more. We will also address these recommendations from the ccNSO review and some of other of ours probably.

The last but not least of our priorities would be to encourage all of you to be Councilors and more active members of our community.

With that, I would like to invite Councilors. Please, could you get up? If you have any questions – Margarita, [another] question? Yes? If any questions, please, these are the Councilors. Come to us. Ask your questions any time. We're here to answer. If there's anything you want to learn more about on the way that Council operates and everything that we do, the only way is to tell us that.

Thank you. Are there any questions?

Yeah, I'm not surprised. It's Eberhard.

EBERHARD LISSE: Why are you not surprised?

KATRINA SATAKI: Because you were sitting there and just ...

EBERHARD LISSE: Anyway, I'm standing here in my North American shoes as an African. Seriously. No. Anyway, this triangle you have I fully agree with. It's absolutely correct in an ideal world. Unfortunately, our world is hardly ideal, especially in our African region. It just doesn't work like this. People agree to give presentations. They

just don't pitch up. They don't e-mail. You do a three-day drive-by DNSSEC training. They think they're competent, and four weeks later we find that the [zone] is off the face of the earth, twice in the last two months.

I like, as far as getting members involved, the ALAC review model. My own company has followed this up. When my partner died, I volunteered, as junior director, to become an observer to SOP. The next step would be rapporteur. Next step would be a member. Next step in a few years would be probably Vice-Chair/Chair Elect. That's the progress so that you actually start doing this from a membership in an organization, in a working group, so that you see what's going on.

As far as the participation is concerned, the PDP retirement is being criticized for being slow. Part of this is because of our particular engagement model, that we make sure we ventilate these things to the end. We want to have a consensus-built model and we don't want the dominant speakers to monopolize this. I think we have reached a good milestone now, so I think it's successful.

In the end, it's not easy if you don't have funding to come to these membership meetings. On the other end, some of my regional colleagues like to travel on other people's expenses and then don't do the work. So it's difficult to [fund].

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you. It's hard to disagree. It is like that. What I wanted to say is that we should not think about others being like us. We have to understand why others do what they do and try to address this. But, yes, I know what you mean. It is difficult when to overcome these differences, let's say.

You wanted to ...

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

KATRINA SATAKI: No, no, no. You can.

NIGEL ROBERTS: Thank you, Katrina. Nigel Roberts, ICANN Board from the ccNSO. Could we go to the last slide please? While we're doing that, I'd like to thank you for the last bit. It was very, very useful, and it's an exultation to all of us, whether you're from North America, Europe, or from another one.

I just think you've missed a [slide]. I think you should say, "Encourage you to become a Board member as well," because the important thing is that we will be having a selection because Chris, who's currently in the GAC at the moment, will be coming

to the end of this term and cannot re-stand. If anybody wants to know what is involved in the [inaudible] in the first six months – we talk about that bit tomorrow – come and see me. I’m very helpful to help. So, please, become an ICANN Board member.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you. That’s a very good suggestion. Thank you very much. I’ll take it onboard. Any other comments?

No. [Dear] Europeans and North Americans. I did not mean that now you’re no going to speak at all. No, that’s not what I meant. Please feel free to speak. It’s just that I wanted to encourage others. [Rolf], I see that you want to say something. Now I’ll be more active and invite you.

[ROLF]: I’m so scared of becoming dominant, so I’ll ...

KATRINA SATAKI: Okay. Now it’s going to be just me talking here. That’s actually what I wanted. I can use all the time in the world to talk. No, we don’t have any other comments?

Okay. Now I will really do active ... Yes, Biyi? You are one of our newest Councilors and you stepped forward, so could you share you experience?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Openly.

BIYI OLADIPO: Giovanni wants me to share it openly. Anything.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: [inaudible]

BIYI OLADIPO: Okay. I think about the newest Councilor. For me, it's been a learning process in that I've been part of the process for a few years. I'd never really been active, but I decided to get active a few years ago. There are a lot of things that I'm seeing which I just used to see from afar. The process is a lot deeper than just coming and sitting for the meetings. It also takes a lot of commitment from every one of us. So, for me, the engagement is better and it's more interesting. I think a lot more people should step forward and take an active participation role in all the things that are happening here.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much, Biyi. Actually, it's a great pleasure to have you on the Council because it's really one of those examples of when someone just comes and does things.

Barrack, anything you'd like to say from the African perspective?

BARRACK OTIENO: Thank you, Katrina. We are seeing more participation from the African region. As AFTLD, we are reaching out to more organizations and encouraging them to be active. We have many challenges, language included, but that said, and with the support of ICANN, we are looking into many ways of making sure there's active and useful participation. I think in the room we have many ccTLD managers who are basically AFTLD members. You will see more of them in different meetings as we go along. We are here to participate and participate actively.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. I'm really happy to hear that. Any other comments from other regions? AP region?

No? I'm sure you can share you experience on how you get people involved.

LEONID TODOROV: Yeah. There is a kind of prejudice that people across the Asia-Pacific shy away from expressing themselves and from participation, especially given that this is huge and not everyone is capable of doing that. Still, I believe that we can see some

increasing interest in participation in the ccNSO in particular and ICANN meetings in general. I believe that what we are doing is that our leading members lead by example and they go and spread the word, so to say.

Secondly, we are trying our best to support our members because not everyone is well-versed in the way, for example, of filing an application to attend a ccNSO or ICANN meeting as a Fellow, so we just try to guide them. Once again, once [we] pave the way, then others would feel more willing and keen to come over.

I believe that, by spreading all this news and alerts and updates from ccNSO, we try to encourage the members and keep them in the loop, so we're more cognizant – I love this ICANN-ish word – of the ccNSO operation and the substance which is discussed here. Their numbers are on the rise. This is my perception. Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you very much. Any other comments? Maybe from the European perspective someone could say something.

[Irina]?

[IRINA]: Katrina, I will never refuse if you ask me personally. That's the main driver for me, probably. Actually, I believe that many other people would definitely agree to take part and to be involved if approached in person because when it's just a call: "If you are interested, please come." "Okay." It's a call for everybody and for nobody in particular. But if it's a personal approach? "I know that you can do this good. Why don't you try?" It will work much better, especially with the people who are probably too shy to step out themselves.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. Some more personal touch, personal approach. [Barbara], I see you – no? You can share you experience of ...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: [inaudible]

[BARBARA POVSE]: I didn't know exactly what you want to hear from me. I also decided to become more active because I was lost here in ICANN meetings. So I decided either to participate or not to come to ICANN meetings. Now I'm participating and getting, as you said, more out of it and feeling better.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. So let's feel better – oh, I see Young-Eum. Great. So if you want to feel better at ICANN's, participate. It's a recipe that's very simple.

YOUNG-EUM LEE: Thank you, Katrina. Just wanted to let you know that there are people sitting on this side of the room also.

I think, in order to become a Councilor, yes, participate. In the ccNSO, if you are interested in what is going on in the world with regard to your participate, then you need to participate in the ccNSO. But in order to become a Councilor, I think there is a slightly higher goal that you need to strive for because, well, if you don't do anything things will, I guess, happen. They have happened. The Internet works, right? But I think you need that special sort of spice in why you participate in the ccNSO if you ... I guess, yeah, you need to want to try to contribute to the general good. I think many more people in this room have that quality and ability than a person like me. So that's why I would like to encourage everyone to try to do that. Thanks.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. Any other comments from this side of the room?

Patricio, you're an active participant.

PATRICIO POBLETE:

Yeah. I've been here, it seems, since forever. I was a Councilor for many years, representing my colleagues in Latin America. I had to make an effort to not continue being a Councilor because there's a lot of tendency that, if you want to say you want to continue, they will reelect you now matter what you're doing. So I decided that my colleagues were mature enough to have some else represent them. So I quit being a Councilor, but I've been trying to keep helping way I can, in particular in working groups and PDPs and so on.

Now I was looking around and I find that there aren't very many people from Latin America in the room this time. I hope that, when it is in the Americas, there will be more. Perhaps it is a bit because the success of LACTLD, the regional organization that organizes several meetings a year with commercial topics and technical and legal and policy. Those are well-attended. Perhaps that's [coping] their quota of travel for the year. We got to do more to try to encourage to come here to ICANN.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you. Stephen, you're from a small island, and Sean, too, you're next.

[SEAN]: Oh, no.

STEPHEN DEERHAKE: I've been involved as a participant for many years. I've been on Council for, I think, two terms. I come again in March again, I believe. I chair the PDP Retirement Working Group, and I promise we will get this done some day.

KATRINA SATAKI: I think you're very promising. I didn't doubt it, actually.

[SEAN]: I'm from the Virgin Islands in the last year, so I've become involved in a lot of the working groups that are there. It's a bit of a learning experience. I understand Maslow's Hierarchy because I do feel impostor syndrome in this room. You guys are all very smart, and I do not feel that way. So I try very hard to learn and listen to you guys.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you. Any – Jordan?

JORDAN CARTER: Thanks, Katrina. Jordan Carter, .nz. I think one of the things you might worry about if you're thinking about volunteering for something is not knowing enough about how it works. My only advice there is: don't worry about that. You do know enough because you work in a ccTLD. You're interested enough to show up to these meetings. So don't worry about not knowing in advance what the process is or how to do it. Just be confident that you have a perspective to add. Once you get into one of these things, you can start learning how it works. You don't have to know in advance.

KATRINA SATAKI: [Pierce]? No, no. Thank you, Jordan. I see Ajay, our NomCom-appointed Councilor.

AJAY DATA: Thank you, Katrina. I just wanted to say there are some non-ccTLD operators who are willing to help you guys through NomCom. So, if you are not running a ccTLD and you still want to work in the ccNSO, then you can be appointed by the NomCom. This is a great place to be. Learn about the whole world, meet new friends, [learn] what's going on. It will take some time to get to know what's going on, but I think eventually you get there. Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you. Are there other volunteers who want to say something?

Yes, I'm sure that Laura wants to say – thank you, Abdulla – another of our NomCom-appointed Councilors.

LAURA MARGOLIS: Good morning. As Ajay said, I am a NomCom appointee. I think it's a very interesting thing, being a Council here. You can learn a lot. You can also give another point of view, as I am not a ccTLD manager, and get involved also in the working groups in different areas. You can learn and also give another point of view. Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much. If there are no other volunteers, then I'll have to say that, apparently – are there any questions about Council priorities, not just about engagement? Anything you expect from the Council? Do we meet your expectations? Are you happy with the priorities?

Thank you very much. Thank you for your trust. Thank you for being here. Just enjoy your coffee break. Thank you very much.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]