

---

MARRAKECH – Fellowship Daily Session  
Tuesday, June 25, 2019 – 12:00 to 13:30 WET  
ICANN65 | Marrakech, Morocco

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Everybody, please wrap up your lunch. Get ready in two minutes.

Please get back to the room, Fellows.

Hello, everyone. Again, I hope you are good. You're enjoying the day? Beautiful weather, right? Okay, great. We have special guests today, our regional team from Africa. You know always that whenever we are going to one region, we usually invite our Global Stakeholder Engagement Team members from that particular region to talk about that specific regional strategy.

I know that we have not many from African region among Fellowship group but the meaning of strategy is probably – and the approach in some cases – unique among all regions. There are some specifics of course, and it is important to understand the main approach. That's the purpose for us to learn more about how regions are working within ICANN and how you can be a part of it.

Yaovi is representing – where are you based, Yaovi? I'm sorry. Bob. Nairobi? Bob is sitting in Nairobi office. Bob Ochieng is our

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

Global Stakeholder Engagement Team in Africa. I was just asking about Yaovi, that's why. Yaovi is going to join us today as well. So, thank you for coming, Bob, and thank you for your time to talk to our group. Without further ado, the floor is yours.

BOB OCHIENG: Thank you very much, Siranush, and I don't mind being called Yaovi.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: I love you both.

BOB OCHIENG: It reminds me of a recent incident in Kampala last week. Yaovi's name proved to be very difficult for many of our friends from Uganda and they gave him a new name, which was easier for them to pronounce, so we can always switch names.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: So, what was the name?

BOB OCHIENG: He'll say it himself. It's a very nice name for him. And hopefully he joins us within this session.

---

Maybe just by introduction, so for those who might not know our team from Africa, we are three people. Hopefully that will grow. We are led by a Regional Vice-President, Pierre Dandjinou. He was not able to make it to this particular meeting because of some urgent emergencies. But I'm here with my colleague, Yaovi Atohoun, and hopefully he'll join us within the meeting. We try as much as possible to cover the Africa region to the best of our capacity and of course ICANN resource is allowing.

Part of the reason why we are here is to change that, we might be three but because of your presence we should impact much more. That means that there are things that you can help us do, so in other words, we don't have to be everywhere. We need to empower ourselves and yourselves and deliver some of these things in your respective countries. That way, we might reach or we should be able to reach greater part of Africa.

So, for this session I want to take you through a bit of what we've been trying to do, as Siranush says, guided by what we have as an African strategy. But you also understand that different ICANN regions have got very specific strategies because our needs are different and so is our diversity. But ultimately, this strategy must speak to what the global ICANN strategy is trying to achieve.

---

There's some kind of implementations at the regional level that is trying to achieve an element of the overall mission of ICANN as an organization and remit. So that means that there are certain things that could be actually priorities in particular regions but fall outside the remit of ICANN. Those are the variables that sometimes we need to keep in mind. Hopefully this should be a discussion, and because you are Fellowship alumni, meaning that you have better experience including in ICANN meetings, so therefore most of these things will not be new to some of you. But I'll appreciate your inputs, questions and most importantly your ideas or solutions that you think could help us advance this.

Hopefully this works. Okay, so we could say, "Next slide," and hopefully the slide will move. Okay, okay.

Sometimes when we say Africa, I'm not sure what comes to your mind, especially if you're not from Africa, but it should look like this. Now, most of the time we have to clarify that this is not one country and it's not South Africa or Nigeria, it's actually 54+ or 54 countries or economies. So, that is important context whenever you talk about Africa.

Now, the other thing that we hear a lot or that we always say is Africa is the future and it depends on who is saying it. But some people started saying, "Is Africa the future or is it now? Should

---

Africa happen now? Because what is future? When is this future?” And if we put that into context in terms of the kind of things that we are trying to achieve then you start to appreciate the challenges that come with some of these activities.

Our strategy was put in place slightly over five years ago. It was a bottom-up process which involved a lot of discussions within the community to identify what they felt was their priorities in far as ICANN’s mission was concerned. So, what could ICANN do that was relevant to Africa?

The document is available on those links, on the website on both English and French languages, so I’d invite you to, when you find time, go through them but I’ll just give a snapshot of what it is trying to achieve at high level.

It has looked at two broad areas. The first one is awareness, which I’m sure you’ve talked about in great detail over the last few days, and capacity building. Now, capacity building is also a very broad term and I think many people use it differently depending on where you are speaking. Capacity building is also targeting very specific areas, and awareness was meant to improve two things: awareness about ICANN within Africa as a continent and bringing the African community’s participation to ICANN’s processes. So, that is two things.

---

Having the community know about ICANN that exist, that there's something called ICANN. And for many years, many a times we'll go to an event or a conference or a meeting and you realize that not enough in that full room. You mention about ICANN and nobody has ever heard about that. And maybe some of you came from that background and today you are here. So that is the first step.

But then you're supposed to move from just knowing about ICANN to coming into the processes or policy making or participation like you are doing today. That was to be achieved through awareness. On the other side, with capacity building, you have a range of topics that you could look at today. We'll see some of them but we've been trying to address specifically from a capacity building perspective.

So, this strategy is broadly addressing two things – awareness in Africa, focusing on those two objectives and capacity building is also having a set of topics and thematic areas that we are looking at. And today we have a regional engagement center. It's located in Nairobi. So far it is only me in that office, but hopefully it will grow beyond – it will be one staff or something like that.

Now, this strategy, like I said, started in 2012, slightly over five years ago. In the last five years, it has been revised twice and

---

each revision involves a bottom-up process. ICANN is a multistakeholder environment and most of the things that we do has to have input from the community. So, it has always moved from a launch through deployment to a review, and what we have now is a second review which was done last year which refined it a bit more.

Remember our needs change and the dynamic, so if we realize that really what we are doing five years ago maybe has now evolved, this document should be evolved to address the same. And you've noted that ICANN itself is in the process of updating its own strategy plan, isn't it? And that means that after that is approved and adopted by the Board, the regional strategies have to follow suit because at the end of the day, they are subsets of the larger strategic plan of the organization. So, you can look forward to another review of this document to also align it with the overall strategic direction of ICANN itself.

What we have now is the 10 objectives that look at various thematic areas that the committee identified that we addressed. You definitely can't read that from here. I think I can find it here. So, I'd like to go over – that slide is a picture of the different capacity building areas that we are focused on and there's a reason for each and every part.

---

Now, the first one, that should be blue, if I'm not wrong. On the top left, isn't it? That is blue. It's DNS abuse and mitigation workshops. I think today and across the different sessions, we've had about now security, cyber security. If you go to the GAC room, everybody is talking about security or cyber security and the different facets of that. And the reality is, they also appreciate that there's no single solution, but if were applied then you have resolved security issues. It means that you address this from the kind of interventions in as far as your scope of reach, goals. So, if you are a telco or if you are ICANN then you can only address security from the perspective of the DNS.

Now, part of the security issues that you could attribute to the DNS is DNS abuse. How can you potentially abuse the domain name system? You may want to look at this from the impact of not addressing that particular challenge.

I'll give an example. If there was a domain name – I'm from Kenya – and there were ccTLDs called .ke, our TLD for Kenya. We have a President whose name is called Uhuru. And in Swahili, Uhuru also means freedom. So somebody registered a name called [IsUhuruinKenya.0.ke]. So, you have two things, the name of the President and the freedom word. Is that domain maliciously registered or not?



---

So if somebody went to court under the circumstances and sought an order to have that name taken down, for example, and because the law enforcement part of the ecosystem really doesn't understand what this domain you're talking about means and they give an order to take down not the domain but the TLD. So, an order is granted to take down .ke, isn't it? You can imagine the impact and you can be assured that the judge who does that has not done it because he intended to take down .ke. His intention could've been to just take down – assuming they were right – the domain name itself. But they can't identify the difference.

What does it mean when you talk of second level, third level, and the top level? And the impact will only be felt in the decisions. And by the way, before that, you know that is reversed, it is in effect. So, you can actually take down a TLD. That is what you try to address through domain name abuse workshops and they're focused on law enforcement agencies within the national government and the judiciary so that they understand, so that we ensure their actions are very accurate or are very deliberate to and measured to what exactly should be addressed. That is in part.

The second part is DNSSEC roadshows which is really trying to have our ccTLDs in Africa deploy security. I think we've been hearing about DNSSEC a lot. In the previous session, we were on

---

the AFRALO Africa meeting and DNSSEC has been highlighted here as one of the hot topics that they're also creating awareness about. So that is security on the DNS and trying to have our ccTLDs implement this.

Now, the other part is for government, GAC capacity building workshops. On Sunday we just had a workshop here for the African GAC members, and this is really to bring the awareness of government itself into appreciating the kind of work that happens within the ICANN ecosystem. Because it is not assumed that they know that ICANN exist. Yet some of the decisions that come out of this – and you've seen in some of the domain names, for example, are of critical importance for governments. But you must first of all bring them on board and really make them understand that what happens here is their consideration.

Now, on the left lower part is DNS entrepreneurship workshops and you'll see why this is important. I think I'll explain it in the next slides. And to go with that, a few years ago we entered into partnership with the [inaudible] widget to actually partner through what we are calling a DNS entrepreneurship center. This is really to train potential business entities that are interested in this particular space to join the business. You'll remember that the internet is also business. So apart from just using it, how best can we also be part of the commercial value and the ecommerce that the Internet promises especially from a domain

---

name perspective? By the way, you can ask a question at any time. Okay.

**KRISTINA HAKOBYAN:** Kristina Hakobyan from Armenia. I'm interested in some statistic or data concerning domain names. So, how many countries are in Africa and how many of them ccTLD and IDN?

**BOB OCHIENG:** A very good question. That is in this slide actually. So, you read my next slide. In terms of how many countries, like I said from the onset, we are at least 54 economies, if you want to look at it that way, in Africa. And in 2016 ICANN commissioned a study of the Africa DNS market. This report is publicly available in our website. It looked at the entire DNS industry in Africa and part of it was to tell us this status, because this did not exist before and I would welcome and maybe encourage you to have a look at this detailed statistics from every country, country by country, and the overall statistics.

Interestingly, from the DNS market perspective – and I'm going back to why we focusing on DNS entrepreneurship workshops as well. We have only identified 52 functioning ccTLDs, meaning there are two that are yet to really be delegated from where we stand. And from a market perspective, if you talk about a three

---

year model, I'm not sure if we are conversant with that but it's how you buy your domain names. You buy them from the registry itself or the organization. In between that we call registrars. So you have only 13 of these countries that have this kind of model, which speaks to something else.

Now, specifically on the numbers, and this is interesting because they could only identify a total of roughly 5 million domain names associated with registrations from Africa. So I'll put this into context. I'm sure we know roughly how many we are in Africa, isn't it? If Caleb is in the room, he would have told you that in Africa every six people, one of them is an Oga brother, is a Nigerian.

So, we're around 1.2 billion people which compares very closely to other countries like China or India, but we have 5 million domain names. Now, out of this 5 million domain names, 1.5 million or roughly there are gTLD registrations. Now, that leaves with around 3.5 ccTLD registrations. Out of that 3.5, 1.2 or roughly is registrations from South Africa as a country. So, that leaves potentially roughly 2 million domain names as the registrations for the rest of the 52 or 50 plus countries. That is a very significant indictment on the business case for the domain name industry in Africa. That is why one of the focus areas is on DNS entrepreneurship because that is part of the remit of ICANN. We are in the domain name space. How can the African

---

community also participate effectively on the business part as well of this industry? The value of – the full registration in Africa can be approximated to around \$50 million. This is just taking the number of registrations times what the cost of those domain names gives you a very rough figure, and that is very low by all means.

We thought that maybe this study could've been different if it was done today. You can't see this from here but this was a follow-up study by AFNIC. Some of us I'm sure are conversant with AFNIC, the registry for .afr. Last year they released a report on the global domain name market industry as well. It's available publicly. You'll also realize one of the slides or tables they have is the weight of registrations by region.

The first part here is ccTLDs then this is .com. This is legacy TLDs. Legacy TLDs are the friends of .com, so .net, those domain names that also have been around for a while. Then you have new gTLDs, so the ones that were released in 2014 going once. They're about 1,000+. This is the total.

Now what you'll see here – this is Africa, this is Latin America, then the third one is Asia Pacific, then Europe, and then North America. But what I wanted to point out here is that if you look at the contribution or the impact of the weight of registrations across the different TLD breakdowns, on a ccTLD registration

---

point of view, this is 1%. This is Africa. If we look at it from a .com registration perspective, it is still 1%. From the other TLDs, it is 1% across. The aggregate is 1%, meaning that today the combined registration of domain name from Africa compared to the global registration level is 1%, which is not very far from the previous study. This is why we felt it's important for us as a region to also address the entrepreneurship part of the domain name market.

Okay. So we do clockwise. Yes, Caleb?

CALEB OLUMUYIWA OGUNDELE: I think I was a bit concerned. My name is Caleb for the record. I'm a bit concerned about the statistics that you just mentioned. You also mentioned that we have 52 countries as against the 54 that we have in Africa ccTLDs that are operational. So what countries are the remaining two on the one hand?

I know we've had this conversation before on media. What is the case of Namibia at present? Because I know that the country's TLD code is being owned by an individual with CEO of like a registry. What is the current situation? How can the country get back its own ccTLD? What is ICANN doing in that case? Is Namibia part of the statistics that you just mentioned now?

---

Okay, another side comment after the question is just a suggestion perhaps to some of us who have ccTLDs, then maybe we can inform our governments that at every point in time that there is a business registration by the government to register an entity, they should tie it with the specific domain name, and it's also a way of tying down certain trademarks for certain businesses. It's just a suggestion. But I need those questions to be answered.

BOB OCHIENG:

Okay. Two questions you have. In terms of which countries are not operational at that time, remember for example, we have South Sudan which became independent very recently. By the time .saudi was done, .ss was not delegated. So clearly, it was not part of the statistics and because it was still going through the process of delegation.

I'm not very sure on the other one. We can check that out but I know South Sudan at that time was not delegated. It was delegated last year. No. [Inaudible].

On the second part of your question, in terms of issues with ccTLDs, yes, there are some challenges in the governance or management of some ccTLDs in certain countries which have been presented or have been communicated to us. One thing that happened is because ICANN doesn't sign a specific contract

---

with ccTLDs, it is considered a national issue. We only have contracts with gTLDs. So ccTLDs are not contracted parties and they're not bound by certain agreements especially by ICANN.

What we could offer is advise on models that they could explore, but it's also important to note that in 206, the OECD – hopefully you read about that acronym, you're used to it – did a study on governance models for ccTLDs and they looked at three models. The first one is why a government entity or government affiliated entity is in charge. The second one is where private sector entity is in charge. It could be an individual, it could be a private organization. The third one is why it is a multistakeholder entity. What they're trying to determine is which one is superior, which one works best.

The conclusion was straightforward, that the process of determining the model to choose as a country should be multistakeholder. But the final decision or the final model doesn't have the multistakeholder. They have cited very many cases or government run ccTLDs that are working very well, very many cases of private sector run ccTLDs that are working very well, and very many cases of multistakeholder run ccTLDs of public interest ccTLDs that are working very well. So the advice was to push for a collective decision on choosing that model but then that model doesn't have to be a specific model as long as it works for the rest of the community in that country. Yes?



---

AMRITA CHOUDHURY: Thank you, very informative. I have two pieces of questions. The first part is, as a GSC Team, you're a global team but you're looking at a particular region. While for the GSC Team, there would be certain issues which are common across regions, there would be certain issues which are specific to Africa. If I'm especially looking at promoting domain names, especially considering it's a flat 1% after activity is being done, so what would be the key issues in this being a plateau at this point of time?

Two, is there some kind of concern – when we're looking at domain names or ccTLDs, I would see 25 or 27 vis-à-vis 54 or 55 countries. Is it because certain countries are especially English speaking or French speaking that they're not thinking of taking their own ccTLDs or something, or is it price which is affecting them? I was curious to understand why the plateau after everything.

BOB OCHIENG: It's a combination of very many issues. Some of them are highlighted in the report which I didn't show. You can't point at one specific issue as the major reason. It's a combination.

---

The first one is historical issue. Internet – because you have to have connectivity first. So when you talk about price, it is also the price of even getting online. It might not be just the cost of the domain name itself. And sometimes it is not the cost of the domain name itself but the cost of hosting or having the whole service because you and me know that normally if you want to go online, if you want a domain – actually, the actual thing you need might not really be a domain. A domain might be needed to facilitate it. Maybe all you want is a website. But for you to have a website, a domain must be created. So consumers will ask for domain names or will need domain names indirectly. Now, if it is a website, for example, the cost of the domain itself as an element could be very affordable. But the cost of having a website or having it hosted or having a personalized e-mail makes it different. So, that is from a price perspective but best is tied to awareness itself, whether there's really a difference. We have countries or markets where you realize people did not know or did not imagine that if you don't have a .com, for example, then that e-mail might go beyond your borders. That's where the awareness creation comes in.

The other part was having our registries really up to scratch, making sure that they are automated because initially that was not the case. Integrating payment systems – making the platform ready for that kind of efficiency has made them lag

---

behind. So by the time that was done in most of the registries, it's playing catch-up. It's a multiplicity of issues across different countries.

AMRITA CHOUDHURY: Just a follow-up, I understand people having hesitations in making a website. I come from India. We face those kinds of issues. Do we have the second largest Internet population? We have 70% not connected yet. Have you ever tried to see whether the people who – small businesses – if they're going online, are people actually going into social media platforms, etc., putting up the pages to do business. Is that growing vis-à-vis domain name growing ... what I'm trying to post is have you seen whether that's being easy for them to do rather than make a website, hosted and charges. Is that growing? Has some analysis been done in that?

BOB OCHIENG: I would say this would not even be a regional kind of study, I think that's a global ... because if we look at the domain name industry global especially 2017, there was a serious plateau. The question is actually for the global industry itself, whether this is one of the areas that maybe has impacted growth in this. I'm not very sure if ICANN would outrightly set out to do such a study. Decision has to be made, whether that is so-so, falling and then

---

the things you're meant to do. But we have contributed in Africa, specifically to a market study on the domain name industry itself in Africa. Sure, maybe associations of registrars like AFNIC or CENTR or AfTLD (Africa Top-Level Domain) Associations could actually commission such a study and seek support maybe including ICANN to understand what would be the impact on emerging technologies and social media on registrations. Yeah, valid point.

This was clockwise and we are here. We'll do another round if time allows, yes.

PETERKING QUAYE:

Good afternoon to all. My name is Peterking for the record. I would like to ask two questions. In terms of capacity building in our cities, looking forward, I realized that ICANN strategy in terms of the African blog – I may be wrong though – your capacity building projects are focused on countries such as Nigeria, Ghana. I'm wondering what has happened to the least developed countries like Liberia, Sierra Leone, and the rest because it must be even and have the capacity to involve all who gets to contribute, who must also have the capacity building. In this direction, what is the strategy going to look at less developed countries or less visible countries in the ICANN space? I must admit, the brand ICANN in some of our countries nobody

---

knows about it. It is a community. So if I'm the Fellow and I'll go back to Liberia and then about 60-80% of the people have not been able to understand that, my relevance as a Fellow is to ensure that ICANN brands can be noticed, then has the African strategy affected everyone.

And number two, in terms of the ccTLD, country like Liberia we just had the issue of this [inaudible] of the ownership of the ccTLD to a government-related institution. What is the ICANN role in terms of identifying how can this be marketed in terms of who gets .org? In terms of the segmentation of the domains, what is ICANN's role in terms of this [inaudible]?

BOB OCHIENG:

So you have two questions. Every time we mention Africa, we normally assume that Africa is already underserved or is served. Now, when you come to Africa – interesting but even now within the African countries, there are others that are more underserved than others. So I understand that perfectly.

I didn't give a picture and this will be part of our presentation on the Africa Strategy itself tomorrow on the kind of engagement and where we have done them. You'll notice that we might have been to certain parts or certain countries more than others. Our intention is really to serve Africa equally and we've made efforts to really try to achieve that.

---

Remember we are constrained also with our resources that ICANN can have at our disposal, and this is why we want to leverage on your network as Fellows, because you understand your countries better and you understand some of the areas of intervention that we need to give priority better. Now we want you to work with us and we could give you material, we could give you content, and where possible we can actually join you to comment, intervene in terms of this event. So having you in the ground is quite important for us.

What we haven't managed to do yet is to closely work with you, and I think we need to make an effort both from our side and from your side as well. We would be happy for you to be reaching out to us and I can tell you, for those who will be reaching out to us consistently, they'll tell you that we respond and sometimes we join them. So yeah, we are very open to that.

In terms of marketing, again a big question whether ICANN should be doing that. If you speak to different parts of the community, they have a different opinion. Now, what we actually believe we should do is building capacity on understanding the domain name as a business. In terms of marketing on driving a particular brand, they can also ask you, "Then why don't you market .ke?" Then they'll ask you then to market [.md]. I think the important part is to understand that this is a business that the national stakeholders, that community

---

– the registrar, the registry – in that country need to invest in it as well. That part we will do to that level and leave it to them to execute it on the ground. That is part of the entrepreneurship workshop that we are doing. Yes?

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: I'm Chokri from Tunisia. As you probably know or surely know that there is some countries in Africa which belong to stakeholder engagement – Middle East and Africa. I don't know how you manage both sides or how you coordinate the effort between the two stakeholder engagements.

Another question about the focus area of the strategy. I know that the strategy is an output of community work or activity. By looking to the strategy, you have two focus areas – capacity building and awareness. I don't know if the infrastructure like creating more, implement more root in the region Africa. Could we interest [inaudible] for next [version] of the strategy? Or did you have discussed this infrastructure issue or area when developing the strategy? Thank you.

BOB OCHIENG: Okay. From root server perspective, the position is that we have 13 root servers with various operators. ICANN is one of the operators operating the L. In the past, we've had an MoU with

---

AfriNIC, the RIR for Africa to support potential hosts with the hardware. Because ICANN only implements the server once you have that [represents] hardware. But the point here is we've realized that when you approach us, for example, for a root server instance, the question is whether you really need one or whether it's the one that ICANN operates the best suited for you. Now, we're in a position to connect with the best suited operator for that particular region but we've also had a number of Ls deployed through our own intervention and Paul will tell you in his previous slide we did exactly that.

So, yes, part of what we do is to support the deployment of at least the ICANN-managed root server but it is not because it is something that we are going to ask you to do. It's an evaluation whether that is the most important infrastructure that you need. If it is determined that an L would be best suited for you as scenario then we'll support you to have an L. If we realize it would be an F or an E then we will connect you the relevant operator to have that happen. But basically for the L, yes, we support that. Yes?

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: First question about the coordination between Middle East and

-



---

BOB OCHIENG:

Sure. Yes. It is true that if you look at the ICANN regions – and this is unintentional internal decision that some of the regions are overlapping. Like today we're in Morocco. And if we look at the diversity in Africa and we look at the diversity within our teams as ICANN staff, what we realize is that within the team, people who are best suited to maybe support a particular country regardless of where that country fits within the region, then that is what exactly is done.

So there are countries that we'll have rotation of different regions. And for Africa specifically, most Arabic-speaking countries – so North Africa or the northern countries, so Morocco, Egypt, Algeria – you could have our colleagues from the Middle East team participating in a number of sessions or interventions or events or when it is determined that somebody from our team would best execute on a particular issue then it will be asked. That one is very flexible. It's not hard coded because we look at who is best place to deliver depending on language and culture and other considerations.

MESUMBE TOMSLIN SAMME-NLAR: Tomslin for the record. My question is somewhat similar to Amrita's. You mentioned you're using the solution of entrepreneurship to solve the issue of domain market growth.

---

But I was wondering if it really solves the issues, the cause of those statistics of the domain market in Africa.

BOB OCHIENG:

We could say not entirely. Maybe this can give you a perspective. We talked about Africa. Now, when you open up Africa, which perception of Africa do you have in mind? Because these too are potentially in Africa. I don't know whether it's your right or left. But is the reality, isn't it? But at the same time, both cases have the right to be online and to have access to domain name if they could afford it or to an IP address if they have a smartphone or something.

So when you now go down to this level then you realize the kind of dynamics that you are dealing with. So it's not straightforward and that's why sometimes we have to define to what extent we can do this. Some of them will be access issues, which is clearly out of our scope, but then can we reach out and engage with who the most relevant to intervene and access. If you look at the way our entrepreneurship workshops are designed, you will not only have ICANN, you will have the rest of the industry players. In fact, some of them you had – including global players coming to also give perspectives or maybe projects that they have in mind and government as well. So it's good to point out our strengths and what we are intervening on

---

and maybe hear from the rest. And maybe jointly we could have a common approach to some of these things. So we can only do up to a very limited part. But the reality is this is the market that you're dealing with.

MESUMBE TOMSLIN SAMME-NLAR: Just to follow up. For the five years that the strategy has been evolving, have you measured the impact of the entrepreneurship in the market?

BOB OCHIENG: Okay, this thing doesn't like your question. You raised an important point. What we've done is we tried to do that exactly. We have a report on the impact of the five-year implementation. A detailed report that is also available on our website – you can download it – and it looks at the various facets on if you take DNSSEC, for example, how was that achieved? Specifically on that, you'll find we've had a few ccTLDs go to the next level of implementing DNSSEC. So it depends on which particular flagship program you are looking at and confirming whether it got anywhere. So that's what we've done and that report is available. I would invite you to have a look. I'm sure it will give you a broader detail on some of these. Yes, Paul?

---

PAUL MUCHENE: This is Paul Muchene. Bob, I have just two questions. One is major and the other is a minor one.

When I look at the statistics of the 1% domain name registrations, 5 million domains are registered in Africa, I see perhaps could maybe one of the reasons for this low-level of registrations be because there are not enough accredited registrars from the continent? Because if you look at the list of accredited registrars, a good number from North America, the EU, and also increasingly from China, they are not as many. In your job, do you actually address this with your capacity building? You actually approach entrepreneurs who are capable of perhaps creating an infrastructure and also have access to funding to actually become registrars or accredited registrars.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: I want to introduce Yaovi to many of you who don't know him. He joined us a bit late but he can take this question.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Thank you. As she mentioned, my name is Yaovi. I'm manager for engagement operation in Africa. Your point is if you have the registrar in the room here – ICANN accredited registrar – the point of view is that the market is not enough for them. I think that maybe what we can do is to create more awareness

---

because as of today, all of us, there are many things we can do remotely. Like if you need to get the name today, you have a lot of options to get the domain name. So maybe it's for people to know about what they can do to register domain name.

In addition, what we are doing, we try to do all the time to provide the information on how people can become ICANN-accredited registrar. Like during the event in AIS in Kampala, the point is that to become an accredited registrar is not easy that you can start from scratch. But what we are trying to do is to provide this information. You can see also that many ICANN-accredited registrars today, domain name business is not something that is helping them to get benefits from this business.

So your point is valid but at the same time, we need to do more awareness so that people know that domain name, they can use it for many things. Especially today, people are linking domain name to website. No. We are paying for postal box in the past and then people should understand that today domain name is something I can use just for my e-mail. It's a personal decision. So domain name is not linked to the website.

Thank you, Siranush, for the opportunity. I have to go back to [NARALO]. Thank you.

---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: I think I should be thankful to both of you, Bob and Yaovi. I think this was a really very interactive session and I appreciate your time being here. I know there are a lot of questions to Bob and Yaovi still here. Yaovi, thank you, you can go. But we might ask Bob to stay a bit longer so you can come and talk to him. But there is another session, people might be coming here so I cannot keep the room for the Fellowship Program.

With that, I would like to thank you once again. Bob, thanks. Text him. And interpreters, thank you very much. Thank you all for being here. I'm looking forward to seeing you tomorrow. Check your e-mails. And yes, I will share this PowerPoint presentation with you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**